EIGHTEENTH CONGRESS OF THE REPUBLIC OF THE PHILIPPINES Second Regular Session

SENATE

P.S. Res. No. 688

)

)

)

Introduced by SENATOR LEILA M. DE LIMA

MARCH 24.

TIME:.

08:03 AM

INDE

RESOLUTION

URGING THE APPROPRIATE SENATE COMMITTEE TO CONDUCT AN INQUIRY, IN AID OF LEGISLATION, ON THE RECENT MISENCOUNTER BETWEEN THE PHILIPPINE DRUG ENFORCEMENT AGENCY (PDEA) AND THE PHILIPPINE NATIONAL POLICE'S DANGEROUS DRUG ENFORCEMENT UNIT (DDEU) WHICH RESULTED IN A BLOODY SHOOTOUT, ON THE LEGITIMACY OF SUCH OPERATION, AS WELL AS THE LEGAL BASES UPON WHICH OUR ANTI-DRUG LAW ENFORCERS OPERATE, WITH THE END VIEW OF DETERMINING COMPLIANCE WITH, AND REFORMING CERTAIN LAW ENFORCEMENT PROCEDURES AND STANDARD PROTOCOLS TO AVERT SUCH INCIDENTS IN THE FUTURE

- WHEREAS, Article II, Section 4 of the Constitution states in part that "[t]he
 prime duty of the Government is to serve and protect the people";
- WHEREAS, Article II, Section 11 of the same declares that "[t]he State values
 the dignity of every human person and guarantees full respect for human rights";

5 WHEREAS, the Supreme Court in *People v. Danisco,*¹ elucidated that 6 '[i]nstigation means luring the accused into a crime that he, otherwise, had no 7 intention to commit, in order to prosecute him. On the other hand, entrapment is the 8 employment of ways and means in order to trap or capture a lawbreaker. Instigation 9 presupposes that the criminal intent to commit an offense originated from the 10 inducer and not the accused who had no intention to commit the crime and would 11 not have committed it were it not for the initiatives by the inducer. In entrapment, 12 the criminal intent or design to commit the offense charged originates in the mind of 13 the accused; the law enforcement officials merely facilitate the apprehension of the

¹ G.R. No. 178060 (23 February 2011)

criminal by employing ruses and schemes. In instigation, the law enforcers act as
 active co-principals";

3 WHEREAS, on 24 February 2021, a bloody shootout ensued between the members of the Philippine Drug Enforcement Agency (PDEA) and the Philippine 4 5 National Police's (PNP) Dangerous Drugs Enforcement Unit (DDEU) following a botched "buy-bust" operation. Among the five (5) casualties from the misencounter 6 are two (2) members of the PNP and one (1) PDEA agent.² According to the initial 7 report from the Batasan police station, the operation was conducted at around 5:45 8 9 PM at the parking lot of a fast-food chain beside a popular mall. It said that the PNP personnel involved, without their knowledge, transacted and engaged with 10 undercover PDEA agents. They also claimed that the PDEA agents were the first to 11 12 fire;³

WHEREAS, while PDEA Spokesperson Derrick Carreon insisted that even if 13 the other details are not yet clear, the PDEA operatives conducted a legitimate "buy-14 bust" operation and had proper documents to back up the legitimacy of their 15 16 operation,⁴ National Capital Region Police Office (NCRPO) chief Major General Vicente Danao, Jr. said that one of the law enforcement teams could have done the 17 18 illegal practice of "sell-bust" - where instead of law enforcers bringing money to purchase drugs from dealers, they pose as sellers and bring drugs to operations to 19 20 capture buyers;5

21 WHEREAS, NCRPO Chief. Maj. Gen. Danao, Jr. maintained that a "sell-bust" 22 operation is not allowed since all cases that are instigated, especially if they are drugs-23 related, are illegal;⁶

² Dimatulac, C. (28 February 2021) *Death toll in PNP-PDEA shootout rises to 5.* Retrieved 18 March 2021, from: https://www.cnn.ph/news/2021/2/28/pnp-pdea-shootout-death-toll.html

³ Talabong, R. (24 February 2021) At least 2 dead after PNP, PDEA shoot at each other in bungled 'buy-bust operation'. Retrieved 18 March 2021, from: https://www.rappler.com/nation/pnp-pdea-shootout-bungled-buy-bust-operation-ever-gotesco-quezon-city

⁴ Garcia, M. (24 February 2021) *PDEA conducting legit buy-bust when Commonwealth shootout happened – spokesman.* Retrieved 18 March 2021, from: https://www.gmanetwork.com/news/news/metro/777312/pdea-insists-buy-bust-legit-in-commonwealth-shootout/story/

⁵ Talabong, R. (25 February 2021). *NCRPO: 'Sell-bust' may have caused PNP, PDEA shootout*. Retrieved 19 March 2021, from: https://www.rappler.com/nation/ncrpo-says-sell-bust-may-have-caused-pnp-pdea-shootout-quezon-city

⁶ Pedrajas, J. (25 February 2021) *Did the police or PDEA commit 'sell-bust'? Authorities investigate.* Retrieved 19 March 2021, from: https://mb.com.ph/2021/02/25/did-the-police-or-pdea-commit-sell-bust-authorities-investigate/

WHEREAS, in *People v. Bartolome*,⁷ it has already been established that "[w]
 hile entrapment is legal, instigation is not";

WHEREAS, in an interview, PDEA chief (Ret.) Gen. Dionisio Santiago said that while "sell-bust" operations are not legal, some anti-narcotics agents "sometimes did it." He admitted that there are anomalous sell-bust operations where drug targets are driven into a trap so they can be arrested;⁸

7 WHEREAS, this bloody skirmish between the two primary narcotics law enforcement agencies of the government, which resulted in a traumatic experience 8 for those who were caught between the gunfire and those who witnessed videos of 9 the incident, occurred on the same day that Department of Justice Secretary 10 Menardo Guevarra addressed the United Nations Human Rights Council (UNHRC). 11 Sec. Guevarra revealed that more than half of the thousands of anti-drug operations 12 launched by the police under the Duterte administration failed to comply with the 13 rules of engagement and protocol. His report likewise noted that, "in more than half 14 of the records reviewed, the law enforcement agents involved failed to follow 15 16 standard protocols pertaining to coordination with other agencies and the processing of the crime scene":9 17

18 WHEREAS, Section 86 of Republic Act No. 9165, otherwise known as the 19 'Comprehensive Dangerous Drugs Act of 2002', requires the NBI, PNP and the 20 Bureau of Customs to maintain close coordination with the PDEA on all drug related 21 matters;

22 WHEREAS, under Rule 37.2 of the Revised Philippine National Police 23 Operational Procedures on Coordination Requirements, prior to any anti-drug 24 operations, PNP units are mandated, as far as practicable, to coordinate with the 25 PDEA;¹⁰

⁷ G.R. No 191726 (06 February 2013)

⁸ Ibid.

⁹ Ramos, M. (24 February 2021) *Guevarra: Irregularities seen in more than half of anti-drug police operations.* Retrieved 19 March 2021, from: https://newsinfo.inquirer.net/1399842/guevarra-irregularities-seen-in-more-than-half-of-6000-anti-drug-police-operations

¹⁰ Philippine National Police. (December 2013) *Revised Philippine National Police Operational Procedures.* Retrieved 19 March 2021, from:

http://www.pnp.gov.ph/images/transparency_seal/2016/manuals/PNPOperationsManual.pdf

WHEREAS, a similar rule on coordination with the PDEA can also be found in
 the Revised PNP Manual on Anti-Illegal Drugs Operations and Investigation¹¹;

WHEREAS, under the aforementioned manual, a poseur buyer in a "buy-bust"
operation is defined as an "undercover Police Officer who acts as a buyer of illegal
drugs for purposes of effecting the arrest of the offender";¹²

WHEREAS, despite such requirement, however, it was later revealed by 6 National Bureau of Investigation (NBI) Deputy Director Ferdinand Lavin that the 7 female asset used by the Quezon City Police District (QCPD) in the operation should 8 9 have actually been in jail. He identified QCPD's asset as Jonaire Decena who had been arrested in a drug buy-bust operation in January. Her participation further 10 taints the already confusing encounter between the PDEA and the PNP. Apparently, 11 it was with Decena that PDEA's asset Untong Matalnas transacted before the 12 misencounter escalated into a fatal gunfire. Matalnas was one of the casualties and 13 his death is of special interest as CCTV footage seemed to show that several men, 14 believed to members of the PNP, took him into custody;¹³ 15

16 WHEREAS, documents submitted to the NBI would disclose that prior to the 17 operation, Decena had an exchange of text messages with a drug dealer named 18 James Tan. According to the lawyer of QCPD, the exchange, as well as the evidence 19 they have on hand that there is "show money" for the entrapment, prove the 20 legitimacy of the operation conducted by the PNP;¹⁴

WHEREAS, in explaining the involvement of Decena in the operation, same QCPD lawyer said that the use of such inmate is justified under Article 11 of the Revised Penal Code. Considering the restrictions of the pandemic these days, they said that it is very difficult to secure a court order, and postulated that Article 11 allows such use because *"puwede kang gumawa ng* harm *kung ang pakay mo doon ay iwasan ang mas malaking* harm..." QCPD likewise denied that the involvement

¹¹ Philippine National Police. (September 2014) *Revised PNP Manual on Anti-Illegal Drugs Operations and Investigation.* Retrieved 19 March 2021, from: https://pro9.pnp.gov.ph/index.php/downloads/send/5-pnp-manuals/278-revised-pnp-anti-drugs-manual

¹² *Ibid.* Chapter 3, 3.1 a. 9) (c).

¹³ Murcia, Å. (10 March 2021) *NBI: QCPD asset a jailbird.* Retrieved 19 March 2021, from:

https://tribune.net.ph/index.php/2021/03/10/nbi-qcpd-asset-a-jailbird/

¹⁴ *Îbid.*

of Decena is an instance of "*Palit-ulo*" wherein operatives use arrested suspects to
 help in arresting other suspects in exchange for their freedom;¹⁵

WHEREAS, Article 11, paragraph 4 of the Revised Penal Code (RPC), on the justifying circumstance of avoidance of greater evil or injury, however, requires that there be no other practical and less harmful means of preventing the evil or injury. The explanation of the QCPD that the difficulty of securing a court order has justified their use of an inmate for their operations, evidently shows that this requirement is wanting;

9 WHEREAS, the use of the QCPD of Article 11 (4) of the RPC betrays a possible 10 misuse of this law to commit criminal acts supposedly under the justification of 11 greater good. Thus, there is need to determine how often our law enforcement units 12 actually commit crime thinking that they are justified under this provision;

WHEREAS, it is imperative to determine the legitimacy of the operations of law enforcement agencies that resulted in deaths of officers and civilians, as well as the legality of utilizing inmates in the operations of law enforcement agents and officers which poses a number of serious risks both to the public and the success of legitimate law enforcement operations;

18 WHEREAS, with no less than the Justice Secretary admitting before the 19 UNHRC that more than half of the anti-drug operations conducted by law 20 enforcement agencies failed to follow protocol, it is important to determine whether 21 the issue of compliance of both the PNP and the PDEA in the established rules 22 concerning anti-drug operations, could have been the cause of the bloody 23 misencounter on the 24th of February that claimed the lives of five (5) individuals;

WHEREAS, it is imperative for the Senate to determine necessary policy reforms or come up with remedial legislation on certain law enforcement procedures and standard protocols to prevent further misencounters among agents of government and other incidents with the same nature in the future as well as improve the legal mechanisms for the accountability of state actors and strengthen the mandate and responsibilities of relevant government agencies involved in such legitimate operations;

¹⁵ Baua, N. (17 March 2021). *QCPD nagpaliwanag sa paggamit ng preso sa drug ops na nauwi sa PDEA 'mis-encounter'*. Retrieved 19 March 2021, from: https://news.abs-cbn.com/news/03/17/21/qcpd-nagpaliwanag-sa-paggamit-ng-preso-sa-drug-ops-na-nauwi-sa-pdea-mis-encounter

1 WHEREAS, law enforcement agencies must be reminded that they are bound 2 by the established rules and guidelines on 'buy-bust" operations. Any reported 3 irregularity in the performance of their duties concerning these operations must be 4 dealt with to the full extent of the law and that the commission of abuses and 5 outright crimes during and after such operations by government agents must be held 6 accountable;

7 NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED BY THE SENATE, to urge the appropriate Senate Committee to conduct an inquiry, in aid of legislation, on the 8 recent misencounter between the Philippine Drug Enforcement Agency (PDEA) and 9 10 the Philippine National Police's Dangerous Drug Enforcement Unit (DDEU) which resulted in a bloody shootout, on the legitimacy of such operation, as well as the legal 11 12 bases upon which our anti-drug law enforcers operate, with the end view of determining compliance with, and reforming certain law enforcement procedures 13 14 and standard protocols to avert such incidents in the future.

15

Adopted,