EIGHTEENTH CONGRESS OF THE REPUBLIC OF THE PHILIPPINES First Regular Session



SENATE

))

)

20 MAY 12 A10 :58

P.S. Res. No. 401

Introduced by SENATOR LEILA M. DE LIMA

RESOLUTION

DIRECTING THE APPROPRIATE SENATE COMMITTEE TO CONDUCT AN INQUIRY, IN AID OF LEGISLATION, INTO THE REPORTS OF PUBLIC FUNDS BEING SPENT TO PAY AND MAINTAIN ONLINE TROLLS TO DISTORT AND MANIPULATE ONLINE INFORMATION IN VARIOUS SOCIAL MEDIA PLATFORMS IN ORDER TO INFLUENCE PUBLIC OPINION AND POLITICAL OUTCOMES

WHEREAS, Article VI, Section 24 of the 1987 Constitution vested the exclusive
 power of appropriating government funds to the Legislative Branch;

WHEREAS, Section 29 (1) of the same states that "[n]o money shall be paid out
of the Treasury except in pursuance of an appropriation made by law.";

WHEREAS, in recent years, the Philippines has become a hotbed of political 5 opportunism and manipulation wherein social media is weaponized to influence 6 public opinion and political outcomes through the use of deliberate and strategic 7 disinformation campaigns. This phenomenon was explored in a 12-month study 8 conducted by researchers in the University of Massachusetts, University of Leeds, and 9 De La Salle University, entitled, "Architects of Networked Disinformation: Behind the 10 Scenes of Troll Accounts and Fake News Production in the Philippines". Published in 11 2018, the study uncovers the professionalized and hierarchized group of political 12 operators who design disinformation campaigns, mobilize click armies, and execute 13 innovative "digital black ops" and "signal scrambling" techniques for any interested 14 political client. Their report revealed that disinformation architects have become a 15

crucial and common part of Filipino political campaigns at both national and local
 levels – employed by many politicians regardless of party and ideology;¹

WHEREAS, according to a University of Oxford study published in July 2017 entitled, "Troops, trolls and troublemakers: A global inventory of organized social media manipulation", the earliest report of organized social media manipulation in the Philippines was done in 2016. In that year, "keyboard trolls" were hired to spread propaganda for then presidential candidate Duterte while many of them continued to amplify messages in support of the president's policies when he won the presidency;²

9 WHEREAS, according to the aforementioned study, a total of \$200,000 or 10 approximately ₱10 million was spent to hire trolls who would spread propaganda for 11 the Duterte Administration and target his opposition. The study also cited that 12 Duterte's team of 400 to 500 cyber troops posted nationalistic and pro-government 13 comments and interacted with dissenters through harassment and individual 14 targeting. Per the report, membership in cyber troop teams in the Philippines is 15 "liminal" but with some coordination;³

WHEREAS, news reports in November 2017 featured a separate study by USbased human rights group Freedom House which claimed that the government had been paying a 'keyboard army', which "could earn at least \$500 a day operating fake social media accounts supporting President Rodrigo Duterte or attacking his detractors". The report claims that the keyboard army's focus was to make it seem that the Duterte administration's controversial and deadly war on drugs had been gaining widespread public support;4

WHEREAS, the Washington Post has even labelled the Philippines as a "hub" of international troll farms which they described as "dramatically altering the political landscape in the Philippines with almost complete impunity — shielded by politicians

١.

¹ Ong, J. C. & Cabanes, J. (11 February 2017). *Chief disinformation architects in the PH: Not exactly who you think*. Retrieved from https://www.rappler.com/thought-leaders/195743-disinformation-architects-philippines. Accessed last 5 May 2020

² Ibid.

³ Matsuzawa, M. (24 July 2017) *Duterte camp spent \$200,000 for troll army, Oxford study finds*. Retrieved from: https://www.philstar.com/headlines/2017/07/24/1721044/duterte-camp-spent-200000-troll-army-oxford-studyfinds. Accessed last 4 May 2020

⁴ GMA News (14 November 2017) PHL gov't paying 'keyboard army' P500 a day to 'amplify' public support for drug war —watchdog. Retrieved from: https://www.gmanetwork.com/news/news/nation/633100/phl-gov-t-paying-keyboard-army-p500-a-day-to-amplify-public-support-for-drug-war-watchdog/story/. Accessed last 5 May 2020

who are so deep into this practice that they will not legislate against it, and using the
cover of established PR firms that quietly offer these services";5

WHEREAS, the aforesaid news article also mentioned that their interview of over half a dozen paid trolls revealed, under conditions of anonymity, that they worked round-the-clock to flood platforms such as Twitter and Facebook with seemingly organic messages of support, but in reality, these were "all an illusion, manufactured by hundreds of fake accounts all meticulously tracked on a spreadsheet";⁶

WHEREAS, in March 2019, Facebook identified and removed around 200 8 pages and accounts organized by President Duterte's social media manager in his 2016 9 campaign, Mr. Nic Gabunada, which were fake accounts that flooded social media 10 feeds with pro-Duterte content - much of which were false and used to attack political 11 opponents. According to Facebook, these pages were highly influential, with at least 12 one reaching 3.6 million followers. This network, which can impact millions of 13 Facebook users, is an example of how inauthentic campaigns can warp political 14 discourse with artificially bolstered messaging;7 15

WHEREAS, on March 15, 2020, CNN Philippines reported that Vice President 16 Leni Robredo had called on fellow government officials to provide coronavirus disease 17 (COVID-19) frontliners with protective gear, instead of allocating funds for social 18 media "trolls". To corroborate the claim, the same report cites yet another study 19 published by an international, non-governmental organization, Reporters Without 20 Borders, which revealed that supporters of the president have been using "call centre 21 hubs" in the country to disseminate "fake or maliciously edited content and fake 22 memes", as well as to conduct "targeted harassment campaigns;8 23

WHEREAS, the Duterte administration has appointed several bloggers and social media personalities in various departments and agencies of the government. It is public knowledge that some of these bloggers have been accused of peddling fake

ţ

⁵ Cabato, R. & Mahtani, S. (26 July 2019) *Why crafty Internet trolls in the Philippines may be coming to a website near you.* Retrieved from: https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/asia_pacific/why-crafty-internet-trolls-in-the-philippines-may-be-coming-to-a-website-near-you/2019/07/25/c5d42ee2-5c53-11e9-98d4-844088d135f2_story.html_Accessed_last: 5 May 2020

⁸⁴⁴⁰⁸⁸d135f2_story.html. Accessed last: 5 May 2020

⁶ Ibid.

⁷ Gonzales, G (7 April 2019) Facebook takes down fake account network of Duterte campaign social media manager. Retrieved from: https://www.rappler.com/technology/news/226932-facebook-takes-down-fake-accountnetwork-duterte-campaign-social-media-manager-march-2019. Accessed last 5 May 2020.

⁸ Limpot, K. (15 March 2020) Funds for trolls should be used to provide protective gear for COVID-19 frontliners — VP. Retrieved from: https://cnnphilippines.com/news/2020/3/15/vp-robredo-government-funds-for-trollsprotective-gear-frontliners-coronavirus.html. Accessed last: 5 May 2020

news and spreading hateful comments against critics of the administration. Some of
whom still maintain such pages as "admins", thereby leveraging their name and
current position in government in order to amplify and lend legitimacy to their claims
which may imply serious conflicts of interest;

5 WHEREAS, with the seemingly consistent findings of various studies of state-6 backed "troll armies" in the Philippines, it is imperative for Congress to verify the 7 integrity of these reports and probe if any appropriated government funds are used to 8 maintain and pay online trolls by various bloggers and social media personalities with 9 their capacity as appointed officials in various government agencies or by the President 10 himself under various discretionary budgets under his office;

11 WHEREAS, manipulation of public opinion through misinformation 12 diminishes the level and quality of our national conversation and is ultimately 13 detrimental to our democracy;

WHEREAS, in order to protect our democracy, we need citizens with critical
thinking rather than those who merely parrot political propaganda;

WHEREAS, it is against the interests of our country to fund online trolls who
manipulate online discussions on national issues for political ends. These funds are
better spent on education, alleviating poverty and improving our healthcare system;

19 NOW THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED AS IT IS HEREBY 20 RESOLVED, to direct the appropriate Senate Committee to conduct an inquiry, in 21 aid of legislation into the reports of public funds being spent to pay and maintain 22 online trolls to distort and manipulate online information in various social media 23 platforms in order to influence public opinion and political outcomes.

Adopted,

ء د

Jeladefu LEILA M. DE LIMA